Ruby - Bug #15658

The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys should be allowed

03/11/2019 12:46 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

Status:	Closed		
Priority:	Normal		
Assignee:	mame (Yusuke Endoh)		
Target version:			
ruby -v:		**Backport:**	2.4: DONTNEED, 2.5: DONTNEED, 2.6: DONE

Description

It was prohibited at 2.6.0 and 2.6.1 to pass both non-Symbol keys and Symbol-keys simultaneously:

```
def foo(opt=nil, **kw)
  p opt, kw
end

foo("str" => 42, :sym => 42)
  #=> 2.5.3: {"str"=>42}, {:sym=>42}
  #=> 2.6.0: non-symbol key in keyword arguments: "str" (ArgumentError)
```

However, at today's developers meeting, we found this change problematic. I'll revert the change soon, and will be backported to 2.6.2.

Rationale: To accept the mixed arguments, we can use an optional argument now:

```
def foo(opt={})
  p opt
end
foo("str" => 42, :sym => 42) #=> works as intended: { "str" => 42, :sym => 42 }
```

However, this might not work in 3.0: it is now considered to completely separate keyword arguments from positional arguments (#14183). We will be able to use def foo(**opt) in the situation in 3.0 because 3.0's **kw parameter will allow non-Symbol key. However, if we want a code that works in both 2.5 and 3.0, we need "manual merge":

```
def foo(opt={}, **kw)
  opt = opt.merge(kw)
  ...
end
```

However, this code does not work in 2.6.1 because it is prohibited.

#14183 is not determined yet, but anyway, we found that this prohibition required more careful consideration than we had expected. So, we cancel the prohibition once, and will reconsider the problem carefully.

Associated revisions

Revision 76fc1ce0a774aab411b4e9f4462c236852624764 - 03/11/2019 12:48 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys is now allowed again

Revert r64358. [Bug #15658]

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@67217 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 76fc1ce0a774aab411b4e9f4462c236852624764 - 03/11/2019 12:48 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys is now allowed again

Revert r64358. [Bug #15658]

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@67217 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 76fc1ce0 - 03/11/2019 12:48 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys is now allowed again

Revert r64358. [Bug #15658]

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@67217 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision dca69588f4a46e1ecc94eeb9e01efc8cd7cb82e4 - 03/11/2019 12:57 PM - naruse (Yui NARUSE)

merge revision(s) 67217: [Backport #15658]

```
    The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys is now allowed again

    Revert r64358.  [Bug #15658]
```

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/branches/ruby_2_6@67220 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision dca69588f4a46e1ecc94eeb9e01efc8cd7cb82e4 - 03/11/2019 12:57 PM - naruse (Yui NARUSE)

merge revision(s) 67217: [Backport #15658]

```
    The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys is now allowed again

    Revert r64358.  [Bug #15658]
```

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/branches/ruby_2_6@67220 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision dca69588 - 03/11/2019 12:57 PM - naruse (Yui NARUSE)

merge revision(s) 67217: [Backport #15658]

```
    The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys is now allowed again

    Revert r64358.  [Bug #15658]
```

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/branches/ruby_2_6@67220 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

History

#1 - 03/11/2019 12:48 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Status changed from Assigned to Closed

Applied in changeset trunk|r67217.

The combination of non-Symbol keys and Symbol keys is now allowed again

Revert r64358. [Bug #15658]

#2 - 03/11/2019 12:57 PM - naruse (Yui NARUSE)

- Backport changed from 2.4: UNKNOWN, 2.5: UNKNOWN, 2.6: REQUIRED to 2.4: UNKNOWN, 2.5: UNKNOWN, 2.6: DONE

ruby_2_6 r67220 merged revision(s) 67217.

#3 - 04/30/2019 08:35 AM - usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)

- Backport changed from 2.4: UNKNOWN, 2.5: UNKNOWN, 2.6: DONE to 2.4: DONTNEED, 2.5: DONTNEED, 2.6: DONE